

Book Reviews

Holiness and Pentecostal Movements: Intertwined Pasts, Presents, and Futures

Bundy, David, Geordan Hammond, and David Sang-Ehil Han, eds.

Studies in the Holiness and Pentecostal Movements

University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press

2022, vi + 274 pp., hardcover, \$114.95

ISBN 978-0-2710-9215-7

Reviewed by Glen O'Brien (Eva Burrows College, University of Divinity)

This first volume in Pennsylvania State University Press's *Studies in the Holiness and Pentecostal Movements* is an impressive beginning for what promises to be a valuable and much-needed series. While Pentecostal studies have boomed, critical historical work on the Holiness Movement has lagged sadly behind in comparison. Linking the two movements, both historically and theologically, makes sense, not only as an explanation of their relationship but also as a strategy for keeping the Holiness part of the equation in the picture alongside its now much larger offspring. An authoritative monograph on the history of the Holiness Movement is long overdue and a genuinely global approach has never been attempted. The excellent earlier work of Donald Dayton, Melvin Dieter, Vinson Synan and others continues to be valuable but there is a need for more recent work to succeed those earlier achievements. This book does not claim to constitute such a definitive resource, but it serves researchers very well as a collection of valuable critical essays.

The editors provide a solid introduction to the intertwined nature of the two movements, helpful for any reader new to the field who is needing to get quickly oriented. The first four chapters bring accounts of important periods, 'At the Beginning,' when the boundaries between the two movements were less definitively drawn. David Bundy's excellent chapter on the straightforwardly named, "God's Bible School" covers

the period from 1892-1910. Situating the Cincinnati, Ohio school as an expression of the Radical Holiness Movement in the Progressive Era and focusing largely on the work of Martin Wells Knapp, he shows how the Holiness movement was a potent religious expression of Populist ideals such as representative democracy, women's rights, and the overthrow of elites. The work of the remarkable Pandita Ramabai is highlighted in Robert A. Danielson's chapter, which shows the connections between Ramabai and Holiness preachers E.F. Ward, Phebe Ward, and William Godbey, in the leadup to the Mukti Revival of 1905. It is valuable in underscoring the function of networks of literary influence in explaining revivals. It is always helpful to ask who somebody was reading when we attempt to understand causative factors in history. It is not a denial of divine activity to trace such influences, but since the demonstration of divine causality lies outside the remit of the historian, causes other than simply 'an outpouring of the Spirit' must be argued.

Early British Pentecostalism is often strongly linked to the Keswick Convention movement, but Kimberly Alexander's perceptive chapter on Alexander A. Boddy and the Pentecostal League of Prayer underscores the Wesleyan influences. She argues persuasively that, not only American, but also British and Scandinavian Pentecostalism may "lay claim to a Wesleyan root" (73), even though those origins were later diluted in a more diverse confluence of ideas and experiences. In the fourth chapter, Luther Oconer skilfully traces Henry Clay Morrison's "World Tour of Evangelism" (1909-1910) which took the Holiness message from Wilmore, Kentucky to Great Britain, Europe, Palestine, India, Burma, the Philippines, China, Japan, and Korea. It was a massive itinerary, covering a lot of ground in a relatively short time. Morrison's focus was very much on the Radical Holiness message of an instantaneous experience of entire sanctification, rather than on divine healing or miracles. His hosts were normally Methodists who welcomed such an emphasis. Oconer shows how Morrison's tour contributed to a "trans-Asian revival... interlinked via a complex web of relationships involving holiness-influenced missionaries, native evangelists, visiting revivalists and literature" which "helped create the conditions for the rise of global Pentecostalism" (110, 112).

The second part of the book is comprised of three chapters around the theme of "Unity and Diversity." Daniel Woods explores railroads as both a spiritual metaphor and as a regularly used form of transport among Holiness and Pentecostal preachers. The enthusiastic embrace of this

modern mode of transportation pushes against the inaccurate perception of a rustic anti-modernism. Drawing on Niebuhr's classic *Christ and Culture* typology, Cheryl J. Sanders evaluates the contribution of Holiness preacher Amanda Berry Smith (1837-1915) and Pentecostal spiritual mothers in the Church of God in Christ, Lizzie Robinson (1860-1945) and Lillian Brooks Coffey (1891-1964). Applying a Womanist analysis, Sanders shows how Black Holiness women fostered "their own empowerment, equality, and social ethics as authentic evidence of their sanctification" (155). Insik Choi argues for Pneumatology as the basis for ecumenical dialogue between the Korean Methodist Church, the Korean Evangelical Holiness Church, and the Pentecostal Full Gospel Church. One of the more interesting aspects of this chapter is its suggestion that the indigenous Minjung (oppressed peoples) theology, as proposed by scholars such as Jong-cheon Park and Jeong-bae Lee, provides a valuable resource for ecumenical dialogue on the Holy Spirit.

The book's final part takes a theological direction as Frank D. Macchia grounds the doctrine of the Atonement in Christ as the Spirit-baptizer. Henry H. Knight III underscores the optimism of grace in the idea of the realised kingdom common to both traditions. Finally, Chris E.W. Green considers the "Cleveland School" of Pentecostal-Holiness thought centred in the Church of God Theological Seminary, Cleveland, Tennessee (renamed "Pentecostal Theological Seminary" in 2004). He identifies Cheryl Bridges Johns, Steve Moore, Rickie Moore, and Chris Thomas as the "foundational four" who developed a discrete school of thought within Pentecostalism dedicated to a retrieval of Wesleyan origins and a commitment to social justice in a Pentecostal-Holiness mode. Defining "blackness" theologically rather than racially, Green calls for the Cleveland School to recover its "blackness." This left me a little uneasy, given that all of the named scholars who represent the school are white. "Blackness" is certainly more than skin colour, but no community can legitimately claim "blackness" without black voices being centred and platformed.

The book is an attractively bound and designed hardback and is well illustrated with a selection of eighteen black and white photographs and illustrations sprinkled through the text. It is fully indexed, with generous end notes. The helpful bibliographies at the end of each chapter are a spur to further reading. The second volume in the series is an eagerly awaited history of *Oneness Pentecostalism*, edited by Lloyd D. Barba, Andrea Shan Johnson, and Daniel Ramírez, built around the themes of race, gender,

and culture. Another volume in development includes a collection of essays on Methodist, Holiness, and Pentecostal women preachers. Penn State University Press and the series editors are to be commended for this exciting new series which promises to make a significant contribution to our understanding of these intertwined movements.

Age of the Spirit: Charismatic Renewal, the Anglo-World, and Global Christianity, 1945-1980

Maiden, John

New York, NY: Oxford University Press

2023, 288 pp., hardcover, \$115.00

ISBN 978-0-19-884749-6

Reviewed by Zachariah S. Motts

John Maiden has created an intellectual map of the interconnected and various people, places, and institutions that formed what became known as charismatic Christianity. As a survey of the historical situation of these movements, it is an incredibly detailed work. It goes a step farther, however, in also looking at the “Spiritscape” that was created, a morphing, communal imaginary that spread across newly formed global networks. More than simply looking at external events, this approach allows Maiden to reconstruct the sense of shared experience that was a major motivating force of this movement. There is a richness to the description in *Age of the Spirit* that is a boon for any scholar of religious movements.

It must be said, though, that the level of detail is dizzying at times. Even though *Age of the Spirit* sets out a range of history and focuses most heavily on the charismatic movement’s ties in the English-speaking world, it covers the subject at hand with thoroughness and rapidity. The text is constantly traversing continents, introducing new names and abbreviations, and tracing a spider’s web of connections. This is, of course, the point; Maiden is attempting to bring to light how the trans-local interconnectedness of this religious movement functioned. Even so, there are times when a bit more narrative background on the human beings that flash past would have been helpful. It is a useful reference for the person already familiar with the constant stream of names and events, but would be difficult to tell the importance or context of many of the named entities

if all one had to rely on was this text. A few more pauses to tell stories of individuals would have been appreciated. As we move further from this history, that sort of narrative elaboration will be important to readers of the future. For that reason, it must be noted that *Age of the Spirit* is not an easy entry point to this history due to its breathless coverage of so much ground, but it is a useful guide for the initiated.

One fascinating piece of *Age of the Spirit* is how new technological possibilities of mass media shaped what the movement became. For our era in which the World Wide Web has made the global flow of information instantaneous, it is illuminating to think through how previous links between communities formed. The cheap availability of the cassette recorder is a technology that made charismatic networks come alive and democratized theology in an incredible way. Part of the reason that the charismatic movement could spread both inside and outside established churches is that cassette tapes of favorite speakers could be passed in a clandestine way between laypeople beyond the watchful gaze of clergy gatekeepers. Maiden's explanation of this element is a valuable piece of his description.

The last chapter on the legacy of the charismatic movement is eye-opening. So many features of the Christian landscape today that could easily be taken as unremarkable, common elements of broader evangelicalism have roots and ties to the history elaborated in these pages. The mainstreaming of "praise and worship" music that opened possibilities for contemporary Christian music, the grassroots networking of religious concepts made possible by the cassette recorder, a renewed emphasis on small groups and prayer meetings: even as the direct influence of the charismatic movement fades, these things have left their mark. Many of the touchstones of the charismatic movement have been incorporated into the larger Christian imaginary in a way that has shaped expectations and norms.

Age of the Spirit is a useful work for the scholar of religious movements or sociology of religion. There is much in Maiden's account that provides the granular detail necessary for a fuller picture of recent Christian history. A formidable work that teases out the interconnectedness of the many strands of the charismatic movement, *Age of the Spirit* is sure to be a guide for future scholarship on this topic.

Henry Clay Morrison

Smith, Ronald E.

Wilmore, KY: Francis Asbury Institute

2023, 384 pp., paper \$27.95, hardcover \$35.95

ISBN: 978-0-915143-55-9

Reviewed by Roderick T. Leupp

Henry Clay Morrison, 1857-1942, has not received his scholarly due, so Ron Smith's addition to the slender accounting is welcome. This fulsome volume originated as Smith's Drew University doctoral dissertation, and the eighteen-year gap between the degree's 2005 conferral and this book's 2023 publication may be due to Smith's excellent explanatory Introduction and two lengthy appendices.

Methodist theology may be known more for its irenic restraint than its polemic crusading, yet Smith is clear about his undertaking one path of historical revision. His accomplishing this stated goal is the main reason to read this book. While Smith does not explicate the full amplitude of Wesley's theology, or Morrison's appropriation of it, he is convincing on this singular point: mainline Methodist theology of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries cannot be consigned to over-heated enthusiasm and heedless, sloppy warm-heartedness. Hence, there is much more diversity among mainstream Methodists of this period than historians such as Mark Noll and George Marsden have been willing to recognize. They were not the one-dimensional "experientialists" of the received scholarly consensus.

American Protestantism of this period is typically cast as a contest between Fundamentalism and Modernism. In this familiar narrative, Methodism typically sails the prevailing winds of Social Gospel optimism, leaving the Baptists and Presbyterians as defenders of true gospel orthodoxy. Morrison's career— twice president of Asbury College, founder of Asbury Theological Seminary— gives the lie to this oversimplification. He strove to express clearly and completely his grasp of Wesley's full theological witness, although strangely, Smith fails to cite the Wesleyan Quadrilateral here, probably because its "coinage" by Albert Outler postdated Morrison's active life.

Outler may have regretted giving to the theological world the "Wesleyan Quadrilateral," but expressed no such regret over christening

John Wesley as a “folk theologian.” Morrison is cut from the same cloth, especially in his preaching and publishing ministries. If anything, Morrison’s *Pentecostal Herald* may have been more successful in spreading Morrison’s influence than were Wesley’s expansive publishing ventures.

In his day, Morrison undertook adventures that, to be honest, would likely escape the notice of today’s leading United Methodist preachers, ethicists, and theologians. Morrison might be said to be more conversant with a wider range of theological advocacy than is true of today’s mainline Methodism. For example, Morrison interacted with the Oberlin College luminary Charles Grandison Finney, although as Smith correctly notes, Morrison’s theology remained theocentric in contrast to Finney’s anthropocentric views.

Smith’s inviting subtitle of *Remember the Old Paths*, illustrated by convincing cover art that captures Morrison’s moment of conversion, working in the fields as a Methodist circuit rider ambled by, yet means something quite different for Morrison than it did for Wesley. As Randy L. Maddox, chief among many others, has shown in his epochal 1994 book *Responsible Grace*, Wesley was comfortable among, and conversant with, the manifold riches of the full, historic Christian witness. By comparison, one must conclude from Smith’s biographical testimony, Morrison was relatively ignorant of these riches. Smith never tells the reader how or why Morrison became “Dr. Morrison,” and Morrison’s theological education seems to have been limited to a single year at Vanderbilt, regrettably unable to pass the year-ending literature comprehensive.

Smith’s book, as he explains it, has benefitted from significant editorial input, yet at times one wonders “where is the editor?” That the plucky Francis Asbury rode “five to six thousand miles a month for an eighty-dollar annual salary, preaching daily,” is doubtless correct as far as salary and speaking, but that equine output is for an entire year, not a mere month (297). Again, Smith writes “tangential” when his meaning must be almost a semantic universe away, namely, “essential” (320). This book also seems to think that “servitude” is a good thing, when more than likely it is “servanthood” that is intended.

One means of asserting Methodist and Wesleyan “uniqueness” is, of course, to return to its centering doctrine of Christian Perfection or Entire Sanctification. To Smith’s credit, he does discuss “Second Blessing Holiness,” and Methodism’s tendency to reject this belief, allowing that Morrison accepted it. There is not much attention paid to defining or even

illustrating just what Wesley may or may not have meant by Christian Perfection.

Paul Tillich assigned to himself the phrase “On the Boundary.” It may be said that Henry Clay Morrison saw himself thus, not on the boundary between philosophy and theology, as for Tillich, but on the boundary of Fundamentalist dogmatism and Modernist accommodationism. If there even is a contemporary Morrison, in 2024, would tossing her or him into the current Methodist ferment be confusing or clarifying? It is an intriguing prospect.

The Mission of the Triune God: A Theology of Acts

Schreiner, Patrick

Wheaton, IL: Crossway

2022, 179 pp., paper \$23.99

ISBN 978-1-4335-7411-5

Reviewed by Jonathan Tysick (Stellenbosch University)

In 1937 Edgar J. Goodspeed asked “where within eighty pages will be found such a varied series of exciting events— trials, riots, persecutions, escapes, martyrdoms, voyages, shipwrecks, rescues—...” as in the book of Acts? (*Introduction to the New Testament*, 187–88. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1937. This portrayal of Acts as a thrilling story has distracted many Christians from attributing a unique theological message to it as is given the Epistles or Gospels. In *The Mission of the Triune God*, Patrick Schreiner— associate professor of New Testament and Biblical theology at Midwestern Baptist Theological seminary in Kansas City— addresses this tendency by providing “a biblical theology” of Acts that “follow[s] the *theological themes through narrative order*” (15, Unless stated otherwise, all italics in quotations are original).

Schreiner opens his book with a brief but helpful introduction that summarises the uniqueness of Acts in the New Testament and its purpose: to provide assurance that “the bumpy start of the community of God is the plan of God” (23). Schreiner recognises that Acts is a “*transitional book*” that “recounts non-repeatable events” while also a “*programmatically book*” that “provides guidance for the church in every age” (21). He therefore emphasises Acts as a “renewal document” that serves as “an exemplar for

the renewal of the church" (20). The author concludes his introduction by sketching out the seven theological themes that frame the narrative theology in Acts and that make up the book's seven chapters.

In chapter one Schreiner makes clear from the beginning of Acts that "all the action finds its source in and stems *from* the Father" (30). Like a musical conductor, the Father has a plan (*βουλή*) that he fulfills through his agent, the word (the orchestra). The content of this word (the performance) is the Father's Kingdom.

The book's second chapter posits that the Father's plan, word and kingdom "centers on the living exalted King" (45): Jesus. Beginning from the early chapters of Acts, Schreiner shows how Jesus's resurrection, ascension, and death remain central in the theology of the book. This chapter also includes a helpful excursus on the Christology of Acts.

Chapter three highlights the Spirit's empowerment of the first century church in Acts. Schreiner nicely outlines the soteriological, ecclesiological and missiological operations of the Spirit in Acts.

Fourthly, Schreiner returns to Acts' "word" theme. Building on the work of David G. Peterson, Schreiner underlines the word as a personified "divine actor" (79). This word has a "Trinitarian shape... a Christological center" and is multiplied throughout the book of Acts.

In chapter five the book describes how salvation (stressing the martial aspects of the term in the OT and First century context) went from Jerusalem to "all flesh," including even to "the pagans and barbarians" (99). This is understood by Schreiner as a fulfillment of various prophecies of Isaiah (98).

The penultimate chapter describes how the church is established in the book of Acts narratively. Schreiner argues that in chapters 1-7 Israel is restored; in 8-12 "outcasts" are "assembled" (108); and in 13-28 "Gentiles" are "welcomed" (*ibid.*). An excursus on the Law in Acts is also included in this chapter.

The seventh and final chapter describes how the church, and especially the apostles, are witnesses, again fulfilling different prophecies in Isaiah 43-49 (138). In Acts, the apostles witness from Jerusalem, to Judea and Samaria to the ends of the earth (142). A conclusion recaps Schreiner's seven theological themes, emphasising how "a retrieval of the theology of Acts provides the groundwork for the rebirth of the modern church" (149).

Overall, Schreiner succeeds in his goal of providing a primer on the major theological themes of Acts without neglecting Acts as a story.

While not straightjacketing himself, Schreiner smoothly structures his chapters so that the early themes are focused on the earlier chapters of Acts, while the later deal with the concluding parts of the story. This allows the reader to comprehend the theology without ignoring the fast-paced story of Acts. Perhaps even more valuable, Schreiner writes as a Christian and is willing to tease out the nascent Trinitarian thought in Acts and allow the text to shape his understanding of the twenty-first century church.

The thirty tables and figures that litter Schreiner's seven chapters are *especially* helpful in engagingly clarifying the theological themes. (See Schreiner's *The Visual Word: Illustrated Outlines of the New Testament Books*. Chicago: Moody Publishing, 2021.) Likewise, the book is strong at connecting Acts to the Old Testament, making it a truly *Biblical* and not only New Testament theology.

Although he references over 125 academic works and articles, Schreiner also writes simply, describing personal experiences and mentioning many pop-culture references like Kanye West, Drake, Johnny Cash, the West Wing and (even) Voldemort. This colloquial approach may direct doctoral students and academics to denser volumes, while the interested Christian may find themselves overwhelmed by the academic bent of the book and prefer a more popular level Bible study. However— in between these two groups— undergraduate and masters students wishing to explore the big picture of Acts in a disarming and theological way will find Schreiner's book to be a gift. Equally, Pastors and Bible teachers beginning a teaching series on Acts will find this volume to be a stimulating guide to propel them into study. I look forward to exploring other volumes in Crossway's New Testament Theology series.

**New Testament Rhetoric: An Introductory Guide to the Art of Persuasion
in and of the New Testament**

Witherington, Ben III and Jason A. Myers

Second revised edition

Eugene, OR: Cascade

2022, xiii + 380 pp., paper, \$45.00

ISBN 9781532689680.

Reviewed by Duane F. Watson (Malone University)

This is the second revised and expanded edition of this volume originally published in 2009. The first edition covered Mark and Luke, the speeches of Acts, Paul as rhetor, the Pastorals, and 1 Peter and 1 John, as well as broader topics of oral culture of biblical times, a brief survey of the history and practice of Greco-Roman rhetoric, and the contribution of rhetoric to New Testament hermeneutics. Some of these chapters have been revised and augmented. This second edition offers additional chapters on the rhetoric of 1 Corinthians and Romans, Captivity Epistles, James and Jude, and Revelation. It also contains new appendices on the elementary exercises of rhetorical education and an unapologetic apology for using rhetoric in the study of the New Testament. Witherington wrote the chapters and Myers expanded those of 1 Corinthians and Romans, and Captivity Epistles. Myers wrote the first appendix, and Witherington the second.

The new chapter on 1 Corinthians and Romans argues that in 1 Cor 2:1–5 Paul does not deny using rhetoric, but using sophistic rhetoric which was more ornamental and ostentatious. In fact, in this passage Paul was using the rhetorical technique of decrying rhetorical ability only to go on to demonstrate it. The letter is classified as deliberative rhetoric aimed at persuading the Corinthians to adopt social concord rather than factionalism as the advantageous path to follow. The *propositio* is identified as 1:10 and the *narratio* as 1:11–17 before the provision of a brief rhetorical outline of the letter. Further discussion focuses on chapters 13 and 15. The hymn of chapter 13 is considered to be a digression composed by Paul using the topic of love commonly used in deliberative rhetoric to promote social unity. Paul uses insinuation throughout the letter to prepare the Corinthians for addressing the subject of bodily resurrection in chapter 15, a subject the Greek mind found revolting and for which such preparation was necessary.

Romans is classified as deliberative rhetoric aimed at unifying the Gentile and Jewish converts in Rome. The *propositio* is identified as 1:16–17: the righteousness of God is revealed through faith and those in covenant with him are likewise righteous through faith. The topics of righteousness (*dikaioynē*) and faith (*pistis*) are developed throughout the letter. The chapter surveys larger blocks of argumentation in Romans with special attention to how Paul is true to the aims and usage of deliberative rhetoric. Chapters 2–3 utilize diatribe against imaginary or perceived interlocutors. Chapter 4 employs proof from historical example. Chapters 5–6 use comparison and contrast (*synkrisis*). The analysis of chapter 7 is significantly more detailed than other chapters, with focus upon Paul's use of impersonation (*prosopopeia*). Adam is assumed to be speaking in 7:7–13 and those in Adam (humanity) are assumed to be speaking in 7:14–25. The section is not autobiographical of Paul's struggle with sin prior to his conversion, but the struggle of Adam and humanity in sin under the law. It is concluded that Krister Stendahl was correct that we should not read the negative introspection of Augustine and Luther back into Romans as if it were Paul's own struggle. Chapters 9–11 refute opposition arguments or any that could be raised against those being proposed. Chapters 14–15 provide ethical instructions based on the previous argumentation and desire for unity. Unfortunately, chapters 8 and 12–16 are not covered.

The new chapter on the Captivity Epistles of Philippians, Ephesians, Colossians, and Philemon assumes that they were all written by the apostle Paul himself to churches in Asia Minor from his imprisonment in Rome. Philippians is deliberative rhetoric giving direction on decisions that the recipients need to make. The *propositio* is rightly identified as 1:27–30 and understood to be developed in 2:1–11, 2:12–18, and 3:1–21. The focus is on the Christ hymn in 2:5–11 by which Paul holds up Christ as an example of humility to be followed in order for the recipients to obtain joy and unity.

Naturally the authorship of Ephesians and Colossians needs to be addressed when discussing their rhetoric. It is argued that the unusual language and style of these books, features typically cited in favor of their pseudonymity, are to be attributed to Paul being a good rhetorician adapting the Asiatic rhetoric of Asia Minor, home of the letters' recipients. I would argue that Asiatic rhetoric, being sententious, elegant, and ornamental, is a rhetorical style that Paul disavows when writing the Corinthians (1 Cor 2:1–5). Rather than indicating that Paul wisely adapts his rhetoric to his audience in Asia Minor, any trace of Asiatic rhetoric in these letters is more

likely indicative that he is not the author of them. However, a word of caution—rhetorical style is not a sharp tool for determining authorship. The use of secretaries who had freedom to compose the author's thoughts, and the many facets of rhetorical situations have a large input on style.

Ephesians is identified as a circular letter using epideictic rhetoric that reminds the recipients of their Christian heritage and encourages them to continue being faithful to it. The focus is on the thanksgiving as a *captatio benevolentiae* (1:3–14), the exhortation in chapter 4, and the recapitulation and emotional appeal in the *peroratio* (6:10–20). While this analysis is certainly helpful, I am left wanting to know how the theology in chapters 1–3 works rhetorically and in relation to the exhortation of chapters 4–6.

There are fewer than two pages on the rhetoric of Colossians which is identified as deliberative rhetoric aimed at solving problems. The focus is on the Christ Hymn (1:15–20) as the *narratio* or statement of facts, an identification supported by Quintilian who noted that a poem makes a suitable *narratio*. Unexpectedly, it is assumed that not only is Paul understood to be the author of Colossians but this hymn as well. The hymn could just as easily be borrowed from house church worship because it was familiar and accepted theology upon which any rhetorician could base persuasion and dissuasion. The short discussion of Philemon rightly emphasizes the role of insinuation and appeal to pathos in the letter. Paul carefully implies that Philemon needs to consider his slave Onesimus as a brother in Christ and free him, all the while appealing to Philemon's emotions as an old man in prison to whom Philemon owes his salvation.

Witherington focuses his discussion of James on its argumentation, style, and structure. For argumentation, James relies heavily on *enthymeme*, that is, a proposition supported by a single reason. The propositions in James are often drawn from wisdom tradition. Diatribal style, rhetorical questions, and comparison (*synkrisis*) further support the argumentation. The bulk of the discussion centers on the many proposals for the rhetorical outline of James and its incorporation of material from Septuagintal wisdom books and the early Jesus tradition, especially of a kind found in Matthew's Sermon on the Mount. Jude is described as "a brief sermon following the conventions of deliberative rhetoric with an epistolary opening and a doxological conclusion" (193). Witherington describes the verbal and thematic parallels with James that perhaps suggest knowledge of the Letter of James. He also evaluates proposals for its rhetorical structure, briefly

discussing the central role of comparison (*synkrisis*) of the false teachers and their teaching, behavior, and fate with notorious sinners of the past.

In the chapter on Revelation, Witherington rightly points out that Revelation is a unique combination of prophetic, apocalyptic, and epistolary literature. As such, its rhetorical nature is complex and multifaceted. Revelation is not a transcript of visionary experience, but a literary presentation of such experience (240). As a prophet, John draws on the vocabulary, images, and ideology of prophetic and apocalyptic traditions, particularly as found in the Old Testament, to create his own prophecy. It is judicial rhetoric mixed with deliberative and epideictic rhetoric aimed at preparing the recipients for the judgment to come. Witherington surveys major current rhetorical analyses of Revelation, ultimately relying on that of Richard Bauckham.

The volume adds two new appendices. Appendix One by Myers, "The Elementary Exercises," explores the four extant handbooks or *progymnasmata* of Theon, Hermogenes, Aphthonius, and Nicolaus that guided elementary instruction in rhetoric in antiquity. These elementary exercises included working with or creating *chreiai* (sayings and deeds attributed to a famous person), fables, narratives, vivid description (*ekphrasis*), speech in character (*prosopopeia*), encomium, and comparison (*synkrisis*). Myers illustrates these exercises with examples drawn from the whole of the New Testament, showing that the study of these exercises greatly benefits the interpretation of the New Testament.

Appendix Two by Witherington is entitled, "An Unapologetic Apologetic about the Importance of Greco-Roman Rhetoric for Understanding the Text and Context of the NT." He rightly points out that the use of rhetoric in New Testament interpretation is not new but has been present since the Greek Church Fathers. Such analysis is historically plausible because rhetorical usage permeated the Roman Empire and rhetorical education was available even in Galilee. More specifically, just an elementary level education contained enough rhetorical instruction for someone to write a rhetorically sound letter. Also, the primary task of preaching in this culture required a knowledge of rhetoric and such preaching easily translated to the letter form meant to be read aloud as a speech. Evidence of rhetorical finesse is found throughout the New Testament at both the micro and macro levels.

The volume ends with a fine forty-three-page supplemental annotated bibliography, the work of Witherington's doctoral student, Eric Laudenslager.

The volume accomplishes what it sets out to do. It explains Greek and Roman rhetoric and illustrates how it works in the New Testament and proves its usefulness for its interpretation. The additional material in the second edition strengthens the volume considerably, providing a fairly uniform coverage of the subject. The volume is now an even more helpful textbook and guide to New Testament hermeneutics.

South Asia's Christians: Between Hindu and Muslim

Mallampalli, Chandra

New York, NY: Oxford University Press

2023, 368 pp., paper, \$29.95

ISBN 978-0-1906-0890-3

Reviewed by Zachariah S. Motts

From the arrival of the Thomas Christians to modern Pentecostalism, *South Asia's Christians* covers an impressive sweep of history in a detailed manner while being surprisingly engaging and readable. Chandra Mallampalli provides an excellent overview that skillfully introduces the reader to the nuanced, complex interactions that have formed Christianity in this part of the world and makes the people and events that drive this history understandable and memorable. While being focused on Christians and their positionality as a minority group among Hindu and Muslim majorities, Mallampalli's narrative is discerning and critical, avoiding hagiography as relationships and motivations are sifted and described.

Mallampalli places Christianity in South Asia between Hinduism and Islam. A fascinating insight of this relationality is the way that these religions shaped each other in profound ways over time. Each are defining and redefining themselves alongside one another as conversions change the demographic landscape, as political powers like the Mughul Empire, the Portuguese, the Raj, and the post-colonial, modern governments fall and rise, and as understanding and interpretation of the other changes and shifts over time. For some South Asian Christians, caste identity as a Dalit or a Brahmin continues to play an important role inside and outside

of the church, inherited from the Hindu context. At other times, the encounters between religions create a move toward stronger boundaries and less porous identities. The Catholic and Protestant missionaries with their scriptural emphasis and confrontational debating style pushed their Muslim and Hindu interlocutors toward similar methods, toward a more consolidated, logocentric, religious self-understanding that could respond in kind to missionary pressure. These consolidated religious understandings become pivotal in the growing formation of national identities that, with the withdrawal of the British Empire, place Christian minorities on the outside as foreigners or colonial sympathizers, even after their long presence in the region which predates the colonial incursions.

The reader is drawn along through the text chronologically with occasional leaps into the future to capture how an era or episode has shaped outcomes in the broader timeline. This gives the chapters a helpful orientation even as the topics shift and the eras unfold. Mallampalli does historical narrative exceedingly well, even while describing the various Christian groups that populate this narrative with particularity and care. Thomas or Syrian Christians, Jesuits, Anglican missionaries, German Pietists, Dalit and tribal converts, Pentecostal preachers: wave after wave of variations on the Christian theme are born in or enter the Indian subcontinent, some believing they are the true and final expression, others long embedded in the local society and seeking to coexist. The strength of Mallampalli's work is in the ability to see the whole and the parts, which allows the reader to appreciate the way these groups encounter, reject, assimilate, and change one another.

Even while being fair to the subjects of his study throughout, there are modern narratives that Mallampalli pushes back on. One is the common refrain that many of the Christians in this region were either "rice Christians" who converted for the economic benefits of aid from Christian missionary institutions, and/or that they were pressured by the colonizing powers to convert to a foreign religion. Mallampalli shows that this is far too simplistic of a view. The history, social reality of converts, missionary accounts, and present-day struggles show a far more complex picture than some of the nationalist rhetoric in the subcontinent would allow.

South Asia's Christians is a book that is broad enough to provide an excellent overview, while being scholarly and thorough in a way that would give a seasoned student of religion, Christianity, or history plenty of enticing leads to follow up on. An enjoyable read, it more than succeeds at

giving context and life to the deep, rich history of Christian interactions and interrelationships on the Indian subcontinent.

Shaping the Past to Define the Present: Luke-Acts and Apologetic Historiography

Sterling, George E.

Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans

2023, 301 pp., hardcover, \$44.00

ISBN 978-0-8028-4873-4

Reviewed by William B. Bowes (University of Edinburgh)

Gregory Sterling is the Reverend Henry L. Slack Dean and Lilian Claus Professor of New Testament at Yale Divinity School, where he has served since 2012. In his well-known 1989 dissertation *Historiography and Self-Definition*, Sterling argued that both Luke-Acts and Josephus' *Antiquities* should be categorized as a generic form that he dubbed "apologetic historiography." Sterling's conclusion has been influential in twenty-first century scholarship on Acts (e.g., Keener's 4-volume 2014 commentary adopts Sterling's view). In this book, Sterling writes a sequel to his initial work, expanding on his reading of Luke-Acts in the context of Jewish and Greco-Roman historiography. Notable features of this work include his discussion of Eusebius' *Ecclesiastical History* as "apologetic historiography," his analysis of Eastern ways of developing identity within Hellenistic contexts, and his approach to Luke-Acts vis-a-vis the Septuagint.

Sterling's work is divided into three parts, each with three chapters. The first part deals with ancient historiography generally, beginning in the first chapter by examining how Josephus, Luke, and Eusebius write history in similar ways and according to similar categories. Sterling suggests that the way that these authors exercised control over their narrative form was related to their attempt to establish a group identity within their culture. One of the ways that Josephus does this in his *Antiquities* is by emphasizing the ancient pedigree of the Jews and their traditions, and Sterling contends that Luke (recognizing Christianity's recent appearance) does something similar to Josephus by emphasizing the continuity of the message of Jesus with what came before. For Luke, Christianity is not so much a new thing as it is "a continuation of the story of Israel" (32). To make this point, Luke's Gospel

edits Markan elements which emphasize the “newness” of Jesus’ teaching, and Acts presents Paul as preaching a recognizable message, cohesive with existing beliefs. The second chapter focuses on Josephus and how Josephus ascribes antiquity to the traditions of Judaism. A key element of Sterling’s argument is that Josephus (especially in *Against Apion*) recognizes a particularly *Eastern* way of writing— one which emerged from within the Hellenistic world but was distinct from it. The third chapter centers on the relationship between Luke and Acts, with Sterling arguing that Luke-Acts is indeed a single work. Notable observations include Sterling’s discussion of single works in antiquity existing in multiple scrolls (released at different times), and his suggestion that Luke edited Mark with Acts in mind.

The second part focuses on the Septuagint. In the fourth chapter Sterling contends that both Josephus and Luke considered the LXX to be incomplete and desired to craft a continuation of it. Using several examples (like the style of the Lukan infancy narrative), Sterling argues that Luke wrote “in a style that deliberately imitated the LXX” (103) specifically “as a mark of continuation” (104), similar to what Greek writers like Xenophon did in their historical works. Luke (unlike Josephus) did not intend to rewrite the LXX but to extend or continue it as part of the established tradition. The fifth chapter argues that both Luke and Josephus sought to legitimize the Jewish diaspora in their writing in a way that provided an understanding of Jewish identity not centered around the Jerusalem Temple. Just as Josephus did this by downplaying “land theology” in his *Antiquities*, Acts is written in such a way as to legitimize the Christian mission beyond Jerusalem. Lastly, the sixth chapter provides an analysis of the speeches in Acts and illustrates their indebtedness to the LXX.

The third part of the book focuses on Luke’s writing in relation to the Greco-Roman world. The seventh chapter provides an exploration of Jesus’ death in Luke’s Gospel, with Sterling arguing that Luke sought to portray Jesus’ death as an *exemplum* (as Socrates’ death was often portrayed), thus rendering its embarrassing features more understandable in a Hellenistic context. In this way he connects Luke with other writers like Tacitus, Lucian, and Plutarch who borrow from similar traditions about death. The eighth chapter focuses on the summary statements about the early Christians in Acts (2:41–47; 4:32–35; 5:12–16). Sterling argues that Luke intended for these summaries to have an apologetic function, establishing the identity of the group. The ninth chapter deals with the (negative) ways non-Christians viewed Christians in antiquity, and the ways

that Luke anticipated or responded to early criticism. For example, Sterling discusses primary source material about how Christians were perceived as having low standing the empire and contends that Luke was concerned with these things and sought to correct them. In the end, Sterling concludes that Luke sought to provide a sense of identification with the larger world while also developing a dialectical relationship with it.

Overall, Sterling's book is a worthy sequel to his earlier work. His work aids readers in understanding Luke's context (as an historian among other historians), as well as the "why" and the "how" of Luke's historiographical approach. Sterling's analysis of Luke's intentional and creative agenda behind his work is incisive and useful, but some readers will wonder how much (if any) of Luke-Acts that Sterling finds to be historically accurate. While Sterling uses no polemic toward conservative readings of Luke-Acts, he considers Luke to be more interested in apologetics than in historical verisimilitude. The tendency to view Luke as an inventor of creative fiction rather than a faithful (albeit creative) historian may repel some, and while he firmly situates Luke-Acts in its ancient context, one could suggest he does a disservice to readers by not addressing how a historian's radical authorial freedom affects the work's value to us in our modern context. Even so, this book is a helpful aid for serious students of Luke-Acts, a work that sought to shape its readers just as it was carefully shaped by a brilliant author.