


1999

Wesleyan Holiness Studies Center bulletin 7:1 (Spring 1999)

Wesleyan Holiness Studies Center

Follow this and additional works at: <http://place.asburyseminary.edu/revitalizationbulletin>

 Part of the [Christian Denominations and Sects Commons](#), [Christianity Commons](#), and the [Religious Thought, Theology and Philosophy of Religion Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Wesleyan Holiness Studies Center, "Wesleyan Holiness Studies Center bulletin 7:1 (Spring 1999)" (1999). *Bulletin*. 7.
<http://place.asburyseminary.edu/revitalizationbulletin/7>

This Periodical/Journal is brought to you for free and open access by the Newsletters at ePLACE: preserving, learning, and creative exchange. It has been accepted for inclusion in Bulletin by an authorized administrator of ePLACE: preserving, learning, and creative exchange. For more information, please contact thad.horner@asburyseminary.edu.



Wesleyan/Holiness Studies Center
AT ASBURY THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY

Bulletin

The Historiographical, Theological and Missiological Challenges of Indigenous Wesleyan/Holiness Traditions: The Case of Japan¹

By David Bundy

Access to the history of the Wesleyan/Holiness traditions in Japan is, for most European and American scholars of this global religious tradition, hampered by a number of factors, and the lack of documentation. The other problems have to do with how the Wesleyan/Holiness movements are conceived by scholars. It is clear that most theories of Wesleyan/Holiness identity are put to severe test by the presence of indigenous Wesleyan/Holiness churches in Japan. The challenge is not only historiographical, however but also theological and missiological.

Wesleyan/Holiness and Pentecostal ideas were and are being spread by several distinct branches of that tradition: the Wesleyan/Holiness Methodist missionaries, the Wesleyan/Holiness daughter churches of American Methodism, as well as The Salvation Army (from 1895) and the Seventh-Day Adventists (from 1896). The Methodist Episcopal and Wesleyan Methodist (British) Churches were early arrivals in Japan.² There were also missionaries promoting ideas of Keswick Holiness within the context of the "mainline" U.S.A. and British mission agencies, especially the mis-

sions of the Presbyterian and Anglican Churches (primarily after 1900).

Other Wesleyan Holiness believers served as missionaries under the aegis of independent Wesleyan/Holiness missions, such as the Japan Evangelistic Bands founded by Barclay F. Buxton and A. Paget Wilkes, OMS and World Gospel Mission. From the beginnings of the Pentecostal revivals, missionaries from all over the world

were selling over one million copies before World War II. Several of the early ordained women in Japan were also Wesleyan/Holiness and served as leaders in the Japan Evangelical Mission, Holiness Church and the Japan Gospel Mission from the mid-1930s.³

A serious problem confronting European and North American scholars is that mission agencies, and institutions related to those agencies, rarely collected non-English

churches in Japan. It has become harder, for it is clear that all of the meta-theory of what it means and has meant for groups to be defined as Wesleyan/Holiness and Pentecostal churches has become less clear.

Mullins analyzed thirteen indigenous churches. As in other places, indigenous groups were formed that adopted Holiness and/or Pentecostal Spirituality with careful attention to Japanese cultural structures. They have always been completely independent of foreign mission organizations. They have Japanese founders and have not solicited or received funds from foreign mission organizations. Some are more Wesleyan/Holiness than Pentecostal. These include, in order of foundation: 1. The Way (1907); 2. Christ Heart Church (1927); 3. Glorious Gospel Christian Church (1936); 4. The Holy Ecclesia of Jesus (1946); and, 5. Sanctifying Christ Church (1948).

These are Wesleyan/Holiness in theology and praxis, incorporating continuing revelation, and "baptism of the Holy Spirit" with strong traditions of healing and exorcism.

The others are more Pentecostal, but with apparent Holiness influences. These incorporate biblical concepts of "speaking in tongues" continuing revelation and Spirit Baptism together with the

From the beginnings of the Pentecostal revivals, missionaries from all over the world have been carrying the Pentecostal vision of Christianity to Japan.

have been carrying the Pentecostal vision of Christianity to Japan. Among these were Pentecostal missionaries with the Wesleyan/Holiness beliefs from the U.S.A., Britain, Australia, Sweden, Norway, Denmark, Finland, India, Brazil, Sri Lanka, Korea, and Thailand. It is difficult to determine the influence of any one from this cornucopia of mission efforts, but it is known that books by Salvation Army leader Gunpei Yamamuro

material related to the traditions. As well, once materials are identified and collected, there are few with the linguistic and cultural skills to read and analyze the materials. Now, with the publication of Mark Mullins' book, the study of the Wesleyan/Holiness and Pentecostal traditions in Japan has been made even more complicated, and much easier. It is easier because Mullins has provided careful bibliographic and prosopographical information about indigenous

Recent Articles & Books on Wesleyan/Holiness Themes

Articles

- Bundy, David.** "Unintended Consequences: The Methodist Episcopal Missionary Society and the beginnings of Pentecostalism in Norway and Chile." *Missiology: An International Review* 27 (April 1999): 211-229.
- Climenhaga, Daryl R.** "The Spirit and the Church: The Brethren and Christ and Pentecostalism in Zimbabwe." *Brethren in Christ History and Life* 22 (August 1999): 273-290.
- Cobb, Stephen J. and Daniel M. Cobb.** "Missionaries in Middle Ground: The Navajo Brethren in Christ Mission as Cultural Broker." *Brethren in Christ History and Life* 22 (April 1999): 5-38.
- Chrisman, Richard A.** "In the Light of All Eternity: the Southern Methodist Church in Illinois." *Methodist History* 37 (October 1998): 37-47.
- Coker, Joe E.** "Exploring the Roots of the Dispensational/ Princetonian Alliance: Charles Hodge and John Nelson Darby on Eschatology and Interpretation of Scripture." *Fides et Historia* 30 (Winter/Spring 1998): 41-56.
- Cooley, Steven D.** "And All the Silent Heaven of Love: Hymn Quotations and Early Methodist Spirituality." *Methodist History* 37 (July 1999): 213-225.
- Eaton, Brandon.** "Jacob Gruber's 1818 Camp Meeting Sermon." *Methodist History* 37 (July 1999): 242-252.
- Goff, James R. Jr.** "The Rise of Southern Gospel Music." *Church History*, 67 (December 1998): 722-744.
- Irons, Kendra Weddle.** "Phoebe Palmer: An Examination of Her Calling in Light of Current Research." *Methodist History* 37 (October 1998): 28-36.
- Jones, Charles Edwin.** "The Color Line Washed Away in the Blood: The Holiness Church at Azusa Street and Afterwards." *Wesleyan Theological Journal* 34 (Fall 1999): 252-265.
- Kisker, Scott.** "Radical Pietism and Early German Methodism: John Seybert and the Evangelical Association." *Methodist History* 37 (April 1999): 175-188.
- Kostlevy, William.** "Culture, Class and Gender in the Progressive Era: The Social Thought of the Free Methodist Church During the Age of Gladden, Strong and Rauschenbusch." In Christopher H. Evans, *Perspectives on the Social Gospel: Papers from the Inaugural Social Gospel Conference at Colgate Rochester Divinity School*. Lewiston, NY: Edwin Mellen Press, 1999, 157-182.
- McGin, Kate and D. William Faupel.** "The Society of Pentecostal Studies: A Brief History." *Ecumenism* 33 (December 1998): 25-27.
- Moore, R. Laurence.** "What Children Did Not Learn in School: The Intellectual Quickening of Young Americans in the Nineteenth Century." *Church History* 68 (March 1999): 42-61.
- Musser, Wilma I.** "Big House on a Little Hill: The Story of Mt. Carmel Home." *Brethren in Christ History and Life* 22 (August 1999): 234-272.
- Orchard, Stephen.** "Evangelical Eschatology and the Missionary Awakening." *Journal of Religious History* 22 (June 1998): 132-151.
- Roney, John.** "Romantic Historiography and the European Reveil, 1815-1850." *Fides et Historia* 30 (April 1999): 3-14.
- Straker, Ian B.** "Black and White and Gray All Over: Freeborn Garretson and African Methodism." *Methodist History* 37 (October 1998): 18-27.
- Troxell, Barbara.** "Ordination of Women in the United Methodist Tradition." *Methodist History* 37 (January 1999): 119-130.

- Weaver-Zercher, David.** "The Status of the Peace Position in the Brethren in Christ Church." *Brethren in Christ History and Life* 22 (April 1999): 90-115.

Books

- Brown, Kenneth O.** *Inskip, McDonald, Fowler: Wholly and Forever Thine: Early Leadership in the National Holiness Association for the Promotion of Holiness*. Hazelton, PA: Holiness Archives, 1999. \$30.00.
- DiPaolo, Joseph F.,** editor. *My Business Was to Fight the Devil: Recollections of Rev. Adam Wallace, Peninsula Circuit Rider, 1847-1865*. Philadelphia, Eastern PA Historical Society, 1999. \$22.50.
- Dieter, Melvin E.,** compiler. *Great Holiness Classics: The Nineteenth Century Holiness Movement*. Kansas City: Beacon Hill Press, 1998. \$34.99
- Graham, Stephen A.** *The Totalitarian Kingdom of God: The Political Philosophy of E. Stanley Jones*. Lanham, MD: University Press of America, 1998. \$37.00.
- Strong, Douglas. M.** *Perfectionist Politics: Abolitionism and the Religious Tensions of American Democracy*. Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1999. \$39.95.
- _____. *They Walked in the Spirit: Personal Faith and Social Action in America*. Westminster Press, 1998. \$15.00
- Turley, Briane K.** *A Wheel Within a Wheel: Southern Methodism and the Georgia Holiness Association*. Macon, GA: Mercer University Press, 1999. \$35.00
- Winston, Diane.** *Red-Hot and Righteous: The Urban Religion of the Salvation Army*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1999. \$27.95.

Initially, funding for the *Wesleyan Holiness Studies Center Bulletin* was provided by the Pew Charitable Trusts. We are sorry to say that this is no longer the case and it has become necessary for us to begin charging a fee to cover the cost of printing and postage. For a one year's subscription (two issues), the cost will be \$5.00, \$10.00 for two years, etc. If you wish to continue receiving the *Bulletin*, please return this portion of the newsletter to:

**Wesleyan/Holiness Studies Center Bulletin,
D. William Faupel, Director, Asbury Theological Seminary,
Wilmore, KY 40390-1199.**

Name _____

Address _____

City, State, Zip _____

The Case of Japan, continued...

healing and exorcism. These are: 1. Living Christ One Ear of Wheat Church (1939); 2. Christian Canaan Church (1940); 3. Japan Ecclesia of Christ (1940); 4. The Spirit of Jesus Church (1941); 5. Original Gospel (also known as the Tabernacle Church (1948); 6. Life Giving Christ (1966); 7. Okinawa Christian Gospel (1977). The Nonchurch Movement (1901) has a more traditional Christian theological framework, but still deserves more study on these questions.⁴

Of particular importance is the chapter entitled, "Japanese Christians and the World of the Dead."⁵ Relations with the dead are of paramount importance throughout the world. Mullins suggests the traditional Japanese patterns and rituals for dealing with this relationship. He then describes and analyzes the ways in which each of the indigenous churches resolve the problem. All of these churches share an

adaptation of traditional Japanese relationships with the dead. The rites and ideas work themselves out in different ways in the different groups, but are significantly different from what one would find among the missionary-founded Japanese churches. While there is significant variety in the approaches, each has worked to find ways to be truly Christian and truly Japanese. Most traditional Wesleyan/Holiness and Pentecostal theologians will find this chapter to be the most challenging.

Many have understood indigeneity (as has this observer) to be essential to the healthy growth of a church within a culture. The data presented by Mullins in his chapter, "Comparative Patterns of Growth and Decline" in which he traces the developments of the thirteen indigenous churches from their foundations to the present, suggests that indigeneity is a

much more complex factor than has been generally recognized.⁶

Mullins has also identified the bibliography produced by each group and presented a short history of each church. His study opens new vistas for understanding the intercultural transmission of ideas in general and of the Wesleyan/Holiness Movements in particular. The problems (ecclesiological, historical, and theological) posed by the phenomenological analysis of the traditions in Japan are not unlike those posed in other areas. For example, there are Wesleyan/Holiness, Keswick Holiness and traditional Pentecostal aspects to the development of the African Initiated Churches. In other areas there are churches like the "Hope of Bangkok" church in Thailand and the "Church of the Universal Reign of God" in Brazil, both of which have become active missionary churches. In North

America, most of the African-American churches, especially the "sacrificed" churches, including the so-called "Oneness" Pentecostal traditions in the USA and other countries, present challenges to the traditional approaches to Wesleyan/Holiness historiography. These examine merely reinforce the importance of Mullins' book that provides a detailed case study of the complexity of Wesleyan/Holiness traditions around the world. Both for the specific analysis of Japan and the contribution to larger historiographical and theological concerns Mullins has authored a very important book.⁷

David Bundy is Associate Professor of Church History at Christian Theological Seminary.

⁴These comments are in celebration of the publication of Mark R. Mullins', *Christianity Made in Japan: A Study of Indigenous Movements* (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1998).

⁵A *Biographical Dictionary of Methodist Missionaries in Japan: 1873-1993* (In English and Japanese) ed. John W. Krummel (n.p.: Kyo Bun Kwan, 1996). This work limits itself to missionaries of groups associated with the World Methodist Council. Therefore it documents Free Methodist and Wesleyans, but not The Salvation Army, World Gospel Mission, Oriental Missionary Society (OMS), the Church of the Nazarene, and others.

⁶See Eric Gosden, *Take Fire! James Cuthbertson of Japan*, intro. Paul S. Rees (London: Marshall, Morgan and Scott, 1960), and A.N.P. Wilkes, *His glorious Power; or, The Story of the Japan Evangelical*

Band (London: Japan Evangelistic Band, 1933).

For a partial accounting of the Wesleyan/Holiness and Wesleyan/Pentecostal presence in Japan, see *Encyclopedia of World Christianity* ed. David Barrett, et al. (Nairobi: Oxford University Press, 1982). The situation has become even more complex since 1980 with the arrival of many more missionaries from Europe, Latin America and Asia. Space does not allow reference to the histories and biographies relevant to this history. Older materials may be found in C. E. Johns, *A Guide for the Study of the Holiness Movement* (ATLA Bibliography Series, 1; Metuchen: Scarecrow Press, 1974).

On this remarkable theologian, see R. David Rightmire, *Salvationist Samurai: Gunpei Yamamuro and the Rise of the Salvation Army in Japan* (Pietist and

Wesleyan Studies 8; Lanham: Scarecrow Press, 1997)

⁷Fukuda Yoshii was ordained in 1934 by the Japan Gospel Mission by Aida Kisuke after graduation from the Kyurei Gakuin (Bible School). The Salvation Army contributed the largest number of women, of any denomination, to the United Church of Christ of Japan. On these issues, see *Grace Abounding: A History of the Ordination of Women in Japan* ed. Kikuko Yamamoto, English editor Barbara Dunn Mensendiek (n.p.: Society of Women Clergy for Theological Studies in Japan, 1999). There is a brief biography of Fukuda Yoshii (105-1993), pps.48-49

⁸For a summary of the theological structures, see Mullins, 48; Mullins, 129-155; Mullins, 156-182; Mullins, 201-216.

⁹On the Thai churches, see Robert Nishimoto, *The History of Pentecostalism in*

Thailand, 1946-1996 (in Thai (Mae Hongson: Create Printing Group, 1996). These grew out of a Holiness revival in Asia led by John Sung. On Sung see, Leslie T. Lyall, *Flame for God: John Sung and the Revival in the Far East* (London: Overseas missionary Fellowship, 1954). This analysis of Sung masks as much as possible the Wesleyan/Holiness connections and theology of Sung, but the chronology appended reveals much if the people and places mentioned are examined carefully.

¹⁰Anders Ruuth, *Igreja Universal do Reino de Deus: Guesnikets Universella Kyrka-en brasalkansk hyrobildning* (Bibliotheca Theologiae Practicae, Kyrkovetenskapliga studier, 54; Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiksell, 1995).

THE WESLEYAN/HOLINESS STUDIES CENTER BULLETIN

D. William Faupel, *Editor* • William Kostlevy, *Associate Editor*

The Wesleyan/Holiness Studies Center

Asbury Theological Seminary
204 N. Lexington Avenue
Wilmore, KY 40390-1199

Nonprofit Org.
U.S. Postage
PAID
Wilmore, KY
Permit #23

Recent Dissertations on Wesleyan/Holiness Themes

- Dunton, Jefferson Davis.** "The Origins of the Salvation Army in New Foundland, 1885-1901." Ph.D. diss., Memorial University of Newfoundland, 1997. DA AAC MQ23129.
- Griffin, John Jarrell.** "Yours in His Service: H. Orton Wiley as an Evangelical Theologian and Educator." Ph.D. diss., University of New Mexico, 1998. DA 982661.
- Hering, Jeffrey Peter.** "Fit for Heaven and for Glory: Lutheran Revivalism in Antebellum New York." Ph.D. State University New York at Buffalo, 1998. DA 9833601.
- Leonard, Juanita Evans.** "Women and the Church of God (Anderson): Mission to the Abaluyia or Western Kenya, 1995-1975." Ph.D. Fuller Theological Seminary, 1998. DA 9833527.
- Livingston, C. Jeter.** "Here Souls Still Sit in Heathen Darkness: The Christian Missionary Alliance as Interpreters of African Culture." Ph.D. diss., Trinity Evangelical Divinity School, 1998. DA9826883.
- Mapes, Mary Lynne.** "Visions of a Christian City: The Politics of Religion and Gender in Chicago's Missions and Protestant Settlement Houses, 1886-1929." Ph.D. diss., Michigan State University, 1998. DA 9909337.
- McDevitt, Theresa.** "Fighting for the soul of America: A History of the United States Christian Commission." Ph.D. diss., Kent State University, 1997. DA 9816206.
- Monteiro, Joao Mateus.** "The Church of the Nazarene in the Cape Verde: A Religious Import in a Creole Society." Ph.D. diss., Drew University, 1997. DA 9732796.
- Moyer, William Andrew.** "Battle for the City on a Hill: Evangelical Interpretations of American History." Ph.D. diss., George Washington University, 1998. DA 9817627.
- Nolt, Steven M.** "German Faith American Faithful: Religion and Ethnicity in the Early Republic." Ph.D. diss., University of Notre Dame, 1998. DA 9833521.
- Nelson, Ricky Charles.** "The Relationship between Soteriology and Evangelistic Methodology in the Ministries of Ashel Nettleton and Charles G. Finney." Ph.D. diss., Southwestern Baptist Theological Seminary, 1997. DA 9819517.
- Roebeck, David Grant.** "Limiting Liberty: The Church of God and Women Ministries, 1886-1996." Ph.D. diss., Vanderbilt University, 1997. DA 9724987.
- Taylor, Marsha Natalie.** "Shoutin: The Dance of the Black Church." Ph.D. diss., Case Western Reserve University, 1997. DA 9818209.
- Ware, Stephen Lee.** "Restoring the New Testament Church in the Holiness Movement of the Late Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Century." Ph.D. diss., Drew University, 1999. DA 9906675.
- Watkins, Ralph Craig.** "The Institutionalization of the African Methodist Episcopal Church." University of Pittsburgh, 1997. DA 9816831.
- Yasutake, Rumi.** "Transnational Women's Activism: The Woman's Christian Temperance Union in Japan and Beyond, 1858-1920." University of California-Los Angeles, 1998. DA 9905514.

Holiness in Los Angeles: A Call for Papers

A seminar on "Holiness in Los Angeles" will be held on Saturday afternoon, March 4, 2000. It will meet after the annual meeting of the Wesleyan Theological Society at Azusa Pacific University. Papers are invited on all aspects of Wesleyan/Holiness culture in California or on the impact of California "Holiness" on the Pacific Rim. Please address any inquiries by **December 15** to:

David Bundy
Christian Theological Seminary
1000 W. 42 Street, Indianapolis, IN 46208
e-mail: dbundy@cts.edu

Papers to be duplicated, and should be sent to the same address no later than February 15, 2000.